

# To Determine the Frequency of Primary and Secondary Meniscal Tears in Full Vs Partial ACL Injuries, as Well as the Location of Meniscal Tears in Complete Vs Partial ACL Injuries

Kanhaiya Lal Gupta

Assistant Professor, Department of Orthopaedics, Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Hospital, Bhagalpur, Bihar, India

---

Received: 03-07-2021 / Revised: 20-08-2021 / Accepted: 10-09-2021

Corresponding author: Dr. Kanhaiya Lal Gupta

Conflict of interest: Nil

---

## Abstract

**Aim:** To study the meniscal tears associated with complete vs partial anterior cruciate ligament injury. **Methods:** A prospective study was conducted in the Department of Orthopedics, Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Hospital, Bhagalpur, Bihar, India from May 2020 to March 2021. 114 patients diagnosed with combined ACL and meniscal injury with a follow up 3months to 1 years of knee injury at our center. The patients were divided into two groups: Complete ACL injury group; 60 knees, mean age 28.2 years) and partial ACL injury group; 54knees, mean age 23.7 years). We compared the two groups with respect to the location of tear. **Results:** The incidence of complete ACL injury was diagnosed with MRI which was 52.63 % and partial ACL injury 47.36%. Regarding the locations of meniscal tears, in complete ACL injury (60 knees), medial meniscal tear was found in 60 %, lateral meniscal tear only in 31.66 %, and bilateral meniscal tears in 8.33 % (5 of 60 knees). In partial ACL injury (54 knees), medial meniscal tear was found in 46.29 % (25 of 54 knees), lateral meniscal tear in 42.59 % (23 of 54 knees), and bilateral meniscal tears in 11.11 % (6 of 54 knees). Medial meniscal tear was commonly associated with complete ACL injury and lateral meniscal tear was commonly associated with partial ACL injury. **Conclusion:** Incidence of medial meniscus tear was more than 50% in complete ACL tear. Lateral meniscus tear was more associated with partial ACL tear compared to complete ACL tear.

**Keywords:** Meniscus Tear, Bilateral Meniscal Tears, Anterior Cruciate Ligament (ACL) Injury, Orthopedics.

---

This is an Open Access article that uses a fund-ing model which does not charge readers or their institutions for access and distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0>) and the Budapest Open Access Initiative (<http://www.budapestopenaccessinitiative.org/read>), which permit unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided original work is properly credited.

---

## Introduction

Meniscus tears are commonly observed in patients with anterior cruciate ligament (ACL) injuries, with a reported prevalence of approximately 55% to 65% [1-6]. Several studies have shown that associated meniscal tears are strong predictors for the development and progression of knee osteoarthritis (OA) as well as worse patient

reported outcomes after ACL reconstruction, especially if a partial or total meniscectomy is performed [7,8]. This observation has led to efforts to preserve as much meniscal tissue as possible, and meniscus repair combined with ACL reconstruction is increasingly preferred over meniscectomy [9].

Whereas medial meniscus tears are more common in patients with chronic ACL insufficiency, lateral meniscus tears are predominately found in acute ACL injuries[10]. Since the complexity of meniscus tears increase in the chronic stage, and tears are less amenable to repair as time passes[11], particularly lateral meniscus tears identified in the early posttraumatic phase may be best suitable for repair. The importance of lateral meniscus repair is emphasized by the fact that lateral meniscectomy is associated with a higher risk for osteoarthritis compared to medial meniscectomy[10]. The pattern of lateral meniscus tears observed in ACL-injured subjects varies greatly and determines subsequent management. Certain tear patterns, such as incomplete longitudinal tears or complete stable longitudinal tears have only minor consequences on knee joint health and can be left in. In contrast, other tear patterns, such as root tears, complete radial tears, and bucket-handle tears, are associated with major biomechanical consequences and should be repaired in a timely manner to prevent rapid joint degeneration[11]. Meniscal tears which are horizontal, oblique, radial, bucket handle is more commonly associated with Acute ACL injuries whereas peripheral tears occurring at meniscocapsular junction are more common in conjunction with chronic ACL deficient knees. The presence of associated meniscal tears increases the risk of subsequent degenerative secondary osteoarthritis[12]. In the present study we investigated the incidence of occurrence of primary and secondary meniscal tears associated with complete vs partial ACL injuries. We also aimed to evaluate the location of meniscal tears associated with complete vs partial ACL injuries.

### Materials and methods

A prospective study was conducted in the Department of Orthopedics, Jawaharlal Nehru Medical College, Hospital, Bhagalpur, Bihar, India from May 2020 to March 2021.

after taking the approval of the protocol review committee and institutional ethics committee.

We collected MRI of 114 patients (114 knees) diagnosed with combined ACL and meniscal injury with a follow up 3months to 1 years of knee injury at our center. The subjects comprised 68 males and 46 Females with mean age of 29.1 (range 20–55) years. The patients were divided into two groups: Complete ACL injury group; 60 knees, mean age 28.2 years) and partial ACL injury group; 54knees, mean age 23.7 years). We compared the two groups with respect to the location of tear. In documenting the location of the tear, we used the classification system described by Cooper *et al.*[13]. This system divides each meniscus into thirds radially. The radial zones are denoted as A, B, and C (A being the posterior third) for the medial meniscus and D, E, and F (F being the posterior third) for the lateral meniscus. A p value less than 0.05 was considered to indicate a significant difference.

### Results

The incidence of complete ACL injury was diagnosed with MRI which was 52.63 % (60 of 114 knees) and partial ACL injury 47.36% (54 of 114 knees). Regarding the locations of meniscal tears, in complete ACL injury (60 knees), medial meniscal tear was found in 60 % (36 of 60 knees), lateral meniscal tear only in 31.66 % (19 of 60 knees), and bilateral (including medial and lateral) meniscal tears in 8.33 % (5 of 60 knees).

In partial ACL injury (54 knees), medial meniscal tear was found in 46.29 % (25 of 54 knees), lateral meniscal tear in 42.59 % (23 of 54 knees), and bilateral meniscal tears in 11.11 % (6 of 54 knees). Medial meniscal tear was commonly associated with complete ACL injury and lateral meniscal tear was commonly associated with partial ACL injury. Bucket handle tear was observed in 11 knees (medial: 8 knees, lateral: 3 knees) in complete ACL injury, and 4 knees (medial: 3 knees, lateral: 1

knees) in partial ACL injury, and was more common in the complete ACL group. When meniscal tear locations were classified according to Cooper, the tears in the partial ACL group were frequently located in zones E and F; that is, middle to posterior region of the lateral meniscus. In the complete ACL group, however, there was an increase of tears in zones A and B; that

is, middle to posterior region of the medial meniscus. Bucket handle tear was observed in a total of 4 knees (lateral: 1 knees, medial: 3 knees) in the partial ACL group, and 11 knees (lateral: 3 knees, medial 8: knees) in the Complete ACL group, with significantly more bucket handle tears in the complete ACL.

**Table 1: Incidence of Partial and Complete ACL injury**

	NO.= 114	%
Complete ACL injury	60	52.63 %
Partial ACL injury	54	47.36%

**Table 2: Distribution of meniscal tears in ACL-deficient knees**

Partial ACL injury	No. =54	%
Medial meniscal tear	25	46.29 %
Lateral meniscal tear	23	42.59 %
Bilateral meniscal tears	6	11.11 %
Complete ACL injury	NO.=60	
Medial meniscal tear	36	60%
Lateral meniscal tear	19	31.6%
Bilateral meniscal tears	5	8.33%

## Discussion

The biomechanics of knee during and after ACL injury may help to explain the occurrence of meniscal tears. The most likely combination injury involves external rotation and valgus force on a flexed knee resulting in anteromedial knee instability[14]. The tibia moves forward and rotates laterally with respect to femur. While portion of medial complex and medial tibial plateau are pull forward by these forces. The medial meniscus is held by contraction of semimembranosus causing stress at the periphery of medial meniscus leading to tears at medial meniscocapsular junction[15]. As valgus displacement occurs there is impingement of posterior or middle portion of lateral meniscus between the femur and tibia which may lead to longitudinal meniscal tears. It is also likely that combination of mechanism contribute to sometimes complex injuries of the knee. In 1997 meta-analysis Bellabarba *et al.* reported that

meniscal tears were seen in 41-82% of acute ACL ruptures and 58-100% of chronic ACL injuries[16]. It is also postulated that majority of peripheral meniscal lesions are associated with some degree of ACL laxity. In our study, incidence of medial meniscus tear was more than 50% in complete ACL tear probably because of primary meniscal tears during injury and also secondary meniscal tear caused by increased knee joint laxity causing peripheral tears of posterior horn of medial meniscus. Lateral meniscus tear was more associated with partial ACL tear compared to complete ACL tears because of index complex knee injuries and decreased knee translation.

In 2001 Smith and Barrete described meniscal tear pattern in ACL deficient knees based on locations of 575 prospectively evaluated ACL tears. They found no statistically significance difference in medial vs lateral tears. However tears involved the medial meniscus significantly involve the posterior

horn and in the peripheral meniscocapsular junction[17]. Thompson and Fu in analysis of multiple papers found that peripheral posterior horn tears accounted for more than half of meniscal tears seen in patients with acute or chronic ACL injuries[18]. Many papers have also pointed out that peripheral location of these lesions in vascularized portion of meniscus gives them potential to heal and make them amenable to repair rather than removal.

In relation to complete ACL tear, the location of medial meniscus tear was more common in posterior horn compared to middle horn, whereas the incidence in lateral meniscus tear was almost equal in anterior and posterior horn because of increased knee translation due to complete ACL deficiency. In relation to partial ACL tear, the location of medial meniscus tear was more common in posterior and middle horn, whereas the incidence in lateral meniscus was almost equal in anterior and middle horn and more in posterior horn due to relative knee translation.

### Conclusion

Incidence of medial meniscus tear was more than 50% in complete ACL tear. Lateral meniscus tear was more associated with partial ACL tear compared to complete ACL tear. In relation to complete ACL tear, the location of medial meniscus tear was more common in posterior horn compared to middle horn, where as the incidence in lateral meniscus tear was almost equal in anterior and posterior horn. In relation to partial ACL tear, the location of medial meniscus tear was more common in posterior and middle horn, where as the incidence in lateral meniscus was almost equal in anterior and middle horn and more in posterior horn.

### Reference

1. Noyes FR, Barber-Westin SD. Treatment of meniscus tears during anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction. *Arthroscopy*. 2012; 28:123–30.
2. Wyatt RW, Inacio MC, Liddle KD, Maletis GB. Factors associated with meniscus repair in patients undergoing anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction. *Am J Sports Med*. 2013; 41:2766–71.
3. Smith 3rd JP, Barrett GR. Medial and lateral meniscal tear patterns in anterior cruciate ligament-deficient knees. A prospective analysis of 575 tears. *Am J Sports Med*. 2001; 29:415–9.
4. Slaughterbeck JR, Kousa P, Clifton BC, Naud S, Tourville TW, Johnson RJ, et al. Geographic mapping of meniscus and cartilage lesions associated with anterior cruciate ligament injuries. *J Bone Joint Surg Am*. 2009; 91:2094–103.
5. Ghodadra N, Mall NA, Karas V, Grumet RC, Kirk S, McNickle AG, et al. Articular and meniscal pathology associated with primary anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction. *J Knee Surg*. 2013; 26:185–93.
6. Michalitsis S, Vlychou M, Malizos KN, Thriskos P, Hantes ME. Meniscal and articular cartilage lesions in the anterior cruciate ligament-deficient knee: correlation between time from injury and knee scores. *Knee Surg Sports Traumatol Arthrosc*. 2013.
7. Magnussen RA, Mansour AA, Carey JL, Spindler KP. Meniscus status at anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction associated with radiographic signs of osteoarthritis at 5- to 10-year follow-up: a systematic review. *J Knee Surg*. 2009; 22:347–57.
8. Shelbourne KD, Gray T. Results of anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction based on meniscus and articular cartilage status at the time of surgery. Five- to fifteen-year evaluations. *Am J Sports Med*. 2000; 28:446–52.
9. Oiestad BE, Engebretsen L, Storheim K, Risberg MA. Knee osteoarthritis after anterior cruciate ligament injury: a systematic review. *Am J Sports Med*. 2009; 37:1434–43.
10. Cohen M, Amaro JT, Ejnisman B,

- Carvalho RT, Nakano KK, Peccin MS, et al. Anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction after 10 to 15 years: association between meniscectomy and osteoarthritis. *Arthroscopy*. 2007; 23:629–34.
11. Cox CL, Huston LJ, Dunn WR, Reinke EK, Nwosu SK, Parker RD, et al. Are articular cartilage lesions and meniscus tears predictive of IKDC, KOOS, and Marx activity level outcomes after anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction? A 6-year multicenter cohort study. *Am J Sports Med*. 2014; 42:1058–67.
  12. Haute Autorité de Santé. Prise en charge thérapeutique des lésions méniscales et des lésions isolées du ligament croisé antérieur du genou chez l'adulte. Recommandations professionnelles 2008.
  13. Cooper DE, Arnoczky SP, Warren RF. Arthroscopic meniscal repair. *Clin Sports Med* 1990;9(3):589-607.
  14. Nicholas JA. The five-one reconstruction for anteromedial instability of the knee. *J Bone Joint Surg Am* 1973; 55:899-922.
  15. Hughston JC. Knee ligaments: injury and repair. St Louis, MO: Mosby 1993.
  16. Bellabarba C, Bush-Joseph CA, Bach BR Jr. Patterns of meniscal injury in the anterior cruciate-deficient knee: a review of the literature. *Am J Orthop* 1997; 26:18-23.
  17. Smith JP, Barrett GR. Medial and lateral meniscal tear patterns in anterior cruciate ligament-deficient knees. *Am J Sports Med* 2001; 29:415-419.
  18. Thompson WO, Fu FH. The meniscus in the cruciate-deficient knee. *Clin Sports Med* 1993; 12:771-796.